

PENNSYLVANIA ORNITHOLOGICAL RECORDS COMMITTEE
613 Howard Road, West Chester, PA 19380

29 January 2003

Daniel Bogar
421 Susquehanna St.
Marysville, PA 17053

Dear Dan,

Thank you for submitting documentation of the Black-headed Gull on 17 December 2000 at Marysville. After careful review, the Committee has voted not to accept this record.

The vote was one member favoring acceptance and six members voting against it. Most of those who voted "no" placed the record in Class IV-A as "a record for which there exists a majority of evidence in support of the observer's identification; the record is probably correct, but not beyond reasonable doubt." In general the Committee felt that the bird was not sufficiently distinguished in the documentation from Bonaparte's Gull. Following are several members' comments:

* "Were there Bonaparte's Gulls there for comparison? Black-headed Gull is noticeably larger than Bonaparte's. Identification may be correct, especially with the dusky underside of primaries, but there is enough room for questions."

* "Need description of upperwing...black bill is troublesome...not enough detail on how other species were eliminated, and 'size of Bonaparte's' bothers me."

* "Size of Bonaparte's is wrong for Black-headed; black bill is wrong for Black-headed; all-white head besides the dark spot is wrong for Black-headed; dusky underside of primaries could have been Bonaparte's under heavy overcast."

Let me emphasize that our non-acceptance does not necessarily mean that the bird was not really a Black-headed Gull, but simply that the Committee felt the documentation did not support that identification adequately. We hope that our non-acceptance in this case will not discourage you from submitting reports on any future rarities you find.

Sincerely,



For the Committee:
Paul Hess, Chair

Record No. 340-03-2000

P.S. I would like to apologize for the delay in announcing our result. We are striving to process the dozens of documentations we receive each year more quickly.

340-03-2000

RARE BIRD REPORT

Species: Black-headed Gull Date of this Observation: 12-17-00

Date Found: 12-17-00 Last Date Seen: 12-17-00

Location: middle of Susquehanna River about 1/2 mile above Rockville Brdg

Township/City: Marysville County: Dauphin

Person Writing this report: Daniel Bogar

Address: 421 Susquehanna St

Marysville, PA 17053 Phone: (717) 957-4719

Other Observers: None

Who found the bird first: _____

Other documentation Included: (Circle all appropriate items)(Make sure all attached items are fully labeled)

Photograph

Audio Recording

Video Recording

If a Specimen, where is it stored? _____

Description: (Attach additional pages as needed —Please do not write on back of this form)

Gull was standing on a rock. Size of Bonapart's Gull. Same overall shape also. Bill looked black. Legs were dark w/ a ~~fe~~ deep red cast and longer than those of a "Bonnie". An indistinct ^{small} dark spot behind eye, otherwise head was white. Mantle same gray color as adjacent ring-billed gulls. When bird flew the dusky underside of the primaries was clearly visible. Wings longer and thinner than Ring-billed.

Distance: 400 yds

Scope: Nikon Fieldscope ED 60 mm w/ 60x eyepiece

Weather: Heavily overcast (probably caused bill to look black)

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Tabulation Form - Round One

Species: Black-headed Gull (Larus ridibundus)

Date of Sighting: 17 December 2000 to 17 December 2000

Location: MARYSVILLE

County: DAUPHIN

Observer(s): Daniel Bogar

Date of Submission: 2000

Submitted by: Daniel Bogar

Written Description: Yes

Photo: No

Specimen: No

Recording: No

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
G. Armistead			X					
D. Couchman				X				
P. Hess						X		
J. Stanley				X				
B. Reid					X			
B. Lebermann P. Rodewald					X			
M. Sharp				X				
TOTALS			1	3	2	1		
DECISION				X				

Comments:

1/6

Signature (Secretary):



Date:

12/28/01